



**SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE
FIFTH REGULAR SESSION**
Port Vila, Vanuatu
10-21 August 2009

SUMMARY OF ISSUES ARISING FROM INDEPENDENT REVIEW

WCPFC-SC5-2009/GN-WP-08
Date 15 June 2009

Introduction

1. The Inaugural Session of the Commission in December 2004 adopted the Final Report of Working Group II which was concerned with science structure and functions of the Commission. Among other matters, the Report recommended:

- a provisional science structure for the Commission for a transitional period (expected to last some 3 to 5 years and representing the period between the Convention coming into force and a fully functioning Commission);
- that, during this period, the structure and functions of the science secretariat be flexible and adaptable; and
- an independent review of the transitional structure and function be carried out two years after entry into force of the Convention, or earlier if required, to determine the effectiveness of the science structure and to recommend changes as appropriate.

2. Following development of the terms of reference for the Review by the Scientific Committee and approval of a supporting budget by the Commission, Marine Resources Assessment Group (UK) was contracted to undertake the Review. Field work and consultations, including at the annual sessions of the International Scientific Committee for Tuna and Tuna-like Species in the North Pacific Ocean (ISC), the Scientific Committee and the Northern Committee, were held throughout 2008. An interim Report was presented to the Fifth Regular Session of the Commission at Busan in December 2008 and, on the basis of additional comments subsequently submitted to the consultants by CCMs, a Final Report was received in May 2009.

3. This document summarizes key recommendations for discussion at SC5. Numbers refer to the Executive Summary paragraph number. The agency tentatively identified may have a primary role in addressing the recommendation.

SUMMARY OF ISSUES ARISING FROM INDEPENDENT REVIEW

I. DATA CUSTODIANSHIP

1) Data gaps

- a) Identify data gaps for scientific data with respect to operational, aggregate, size and tagging data (8, SPC)
- b) Approach to address such gaps
 - i) Continue outreach activities (9, Secretariat, ST-SWG)¹
 - ii) Develop and use of practical guidelines (9, SPC)
 - iii) Impose sanctions for non-compliance (10, TCC, Commission)

2) Data management and confidentiality

- a) Adopt Data Exchange Agreement between WCPFC and SPC² (14, SPC, Commission (*done at WCPFC5*))

3) Data custodianship service

- a) Strengthen confidence in data custodianship services as a means to address data submission shortfalls (16, AHTG[Data], SPC, Commission)
- b) Develop a three-year service agreement with SPC to secure resources (13, 17, SPC, SC, Commission)
- c) Commission takes additional steps to improve data reporting and supporting SPC (18, SPC, Secretariat)
- d) Incorporation of ISC data into the WCPFC holdings (20, 45, ISC, SPC, Secretariat)

II. SCIENCE STRUCTURE AND FUNCTIONS

4) Process of project contract

- a) Update guidelines (Attachment M of the SC4 Report) of processing SC work programme (24, 31, Secretariat, SC/RSC)
- b) Improve the level of advertising, funding and scope of candidate projects in an effort to attract increased responses to research opportunities (25, 26, 33, Secretariat, SC)

5) Quality of scientific advice available to the Commission

- a) Implement periodic external peer review process on all contracted assessments of the Commission, including reciprocal review with other tuna RFMOs (26, 30, 33, 53, IATTC, ISC, SC)
 - i) Include peer reviewer's participation in the stock assessment process as well as their review of the models and results (26, SPC, ISC, SC)
 - ii) Allow sufficient time for the SC to review the results of peer review prior to presentation to SC (26, SPC, ISC, SC)

¹ Numbers refer to the Executive Summary paragraph number. The agency or body tentatively identified may have a primary role in addressing the recommendation.

² Adopted at WCPFC5

- b) Develop a standard procedure for CCMs to undertake duplicate assessments (28, SPC, SA-SWG, SC)
- c) Maintain transparency by posting research inputs and outputs on website (30, Secretariat)
- d) Develop a strategy to maximise the use of science knowledge of the SPC-OFP and other existing or potential contractors in deciding science needs and priorities (31, SC/RSC, Secretariat)
- e) SPC to continue training of talented individuals from developing CCMs to enhance their full participation in the scientific activities of the Commission (38, 68, SPC, Secretariat)

6) International Scientific Committee (ISC)

- a) Amend MOU to allow for ISC work to be requested by the SC as well as the NC (40, 64, 67, Secretariat, ISC, SC, Commission)
- b) To support robust science within the ISC
 - i) Additional review by the SC and external peer review (41, 42, ISC, SC, Commission)
 - ii) For transparency, promote wider participation in ISC's assessment activities with relevant experts, and sufficient funding (41, 43, ISC, SC, Commission)
 - iii) SC and NC, with funding support, request ISC of validation work on key ISC assessments (41, 44, ISC, SC, NC)
- c) Improve support to ISC (59, 61, ISC, SC, NC, Commission)
 - i) Promote ISC officers' attendance at SA-SWG to present their assessments (61, ISC, SC)
 - ii) On-time submission of ISC documents to SC (61, ISC)
 - iii) Allow sufficient time for SC to review ISC's assessments and advice (65, ISC, SC)
- d) To promote harmonization of the Commission's science functions, the SC's research plan should include the ISC's work plan (64, ISC, SC)

7) Restructuring the SC process

- a) To clarify the role of SC and ISC in advising NC, the SC, as the statutory WCPFC body, should take the lead in endorsing the scientific work done by the Commission's science providers and SWGs, and providing advice to the NC and Commission, even if this advice is a simple endorsement of the advice of other bodies such as the ISC (49, 66, SPC, ISC, SC, NC, Commission)
 - i) The SC Chair introduces the SC report to NC (66, SC, NC)
 - ii) The ISC Chair presents and provides technical explanation to NC in a non-confrontational way between SC and ISC (66, ISC, SC, NC)
- b) Specialist Working Groups and related processes.
 - i) Strengthening Stock Assessment Preparatory Workshop (SAPW) by the WCPFC taking ownership of that activity with appropriate funding support (27, 50, SPC, SC, Commission)
 - ii) Incorporate the BI-SWG and ME-SWG into SAPW (50, SPC, SC)
 - iii) Revise the Terms of Reference of the SAPW to include provision for agreement on data inputs, model runs and the setting of an appropriate timetable (50, SPC, SC)

- iv) Identify risks and seek solutions to address such risks when SAPW is expanded (51, SPC, SC)
 - v) Promote the participation of ISC and IATTC in the SWGs to promote coordination of ocean-wide assessments and include northern stocks in the agenda of the SAPW (52, SPC, ISC, IATTC, SC)
- c) Consider other workshops on species not included in the main SPC-OFP work programme (54, 64, SPC, SC)
 - d) Allocate significantly more time to SA-SWG to thoroughly review all assessment-related outputs from SPC-OFP, ISC and CCMs (55, SA-SWG, SC)
 - e) Restructuring of the SWGs
 - i) Have an annual meeting for EB-SWG and SA-SWG only (57, SC)
 - ii) Have biennial or occasional meetings for the FT-SWG and ST-SWG (57, SC)
 - iii) BI-SWG and ME-SWG to be absorbed into SAPW (or SA-SWG) or have occasional meetings (57, SC)
 - iv) Less formal process of the SWG meetings, including no national representation and more intensive involvement of experts (58, SC)
 - f) Establish an Ad-hoc Group on Socio-economic Issues which identifies:
 - i) socio-economic issues and how they might be addressed (60, SC, Commission)
 - ii) types of information and analyses required to generate appropriate management advice (60, SC, Commission)
 - iii) availability of expertise within the CCMs and/or potential service providers to undertake the necessary work (60, SC, Commission)

III. IMPLEMENTATION

8) Implementation of the recommendations

- a) Develop a work plan for the implementation of these recommendations (70, SC, Commission).